



UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

This is a repository copy of *The Effects and Experience of Shiatsu: A Cross-European Study. Final Report.*

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:

<http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/42957/>

Monograph:

Long, AF (2007) *The Effects and Experience of Shiatsu: A Cross-European Study. Final Report.* Report. School of Healthcare, University of Leeds , Leeds, UK.

Reuse

See Attached

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.

The Effects and Experience of Shiatsu: A Cross-European Study

FINAL REPORT

Andrew F Long
School of Healthcare, University of Leeds
December 2007

The Effects and Experience of Shiatsu: A Cross-European Study

Andrew F Long
School of Healthcare, University of Leeds
December 2007

© University of Leeds

Bibliographic details are as follows:

Long AF (2007) *The Effects and Experience of Shiatsu: A Cross-European Study*. Leeds: University of Leeds, School of Healthcare.

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	i
FOREWORD	iii
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....	vi
<i>Background.....</i>	vi
<i>Study's Aims</i>	vi
<i>Methods</i>	vi
<i>Key Findings</i>	vii
<i>Key Policy, Practice and Research Implications.....</i>	xi
GLOSSARY OF TERMS	xiii
Chapter One: Introduction and Report Overview	1
<i>Introduction and Background.....</i>	1
<i>Overview of the Report.....</i>	1
SECTION ONE: STUDY DESIGN AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK OF SHIATSU4	
Chapter Two: Study Methods	5
<i>Introduction</i>	5
<i>Study's Aims</i>	5
<i>Overall Approach</i>	5
<i>Desired Sample Size</i>	6
<i>Phase One: Practitioner Recruitment</i>	6
<i>Phase Two: Client Recruitment</i>	8
<i>Measurement Tools and Timescale.....</i>	10
<i>Ethical Issues.....</i>	12
<i>Quality Assurance.....</i>	13
<i>Data Analysis</i>	13
<i>Numerical Data</i>	13
<i>Client Verbatim Comments</i>	13
<i>Final Data Set.....</i>	15
<i>Summary.....</i>	15
Chapter Three: Understanding the Findings through the Lens of Shiatsu's Guiding Philosophy	17
<i>Introduction</i>	17
<i>A Theoretical Framework.....</i>	18
<i>Linking the Framework to the Data</i>	21
<i>Summary.....</i>	22
SECTION TWO: AUSTRIA.....	24
Chapter Four: Study Participants and Study Representativeness	25
<i>Introduction</i>	25
<i>The Practitioners.....</i>	25
<i>The Clients.....</i>	26
<i>Summary.....</i>	29
Chapter Five: Who Uses Shiatsu, Why and For What Reasons?	30
<i>Introduction</i>	30
<i>Socio-Demographic Characteristics at Baseline.....</i>	30
<i>Previous Use of Shiatsu and Other CAM at Baseline.....</i>	30
<i>Health Status at Baseline.....</i>	30
<i>Reasons for Having Shiatsu Treatment and Associated Symptoms</i>	31
<i>Continuing Use of Shiatsu over the Six-Month Follow-Up Period.....</i>	33
<i>Summary.....</i>	34
Chapter Six: Clients' Hopes from Shiatsu	35

<i>Introduction</i>	35
<i>Hopes from Their Shiatsu Treatment</i>	35
<i>Summary</i>	44
Chapter Seven: The Client's Initial Experiences of Shiatsu	45
<i>Introduction</i>	45
<i>Experiences during the Most Recent Shiatsu Treatment</i>	45
<i>Client-Practitioner Relationship</i>	47
<i>Experiences after the Most Recent Shiatsu Treatment</i>	48
<i>Summary</i>	51
Chapter Eight: Evidence of Effectiveness: Symptom Change.....	53
<i>Introduction</i>	53
<i>A: Improvements in Symptom Severity over the Six Months</i>	53
<i>B: Changes in Symptom Severity</i>	54
<i>C: Changes in Symptom Severity – Previous Users</i>	56
<i>D: Overall Effectiveness in Treating My Symptoms</i>	56
<i>Summary</i>	57
Chapter Nine: Evidence of Effectiveness: Shiatsu-Specific Effects	58
<i>Introduction</i>	58
<i>A: Overall Effects</i>	58
<i>B: Specific Symptom Changes</i>	61
<i>C: General Awareness Effects</i>	61
<i>D: General Attitudinal / Personal Effects</i>	62
<i>E: Relational Effects</i>	63
<i>Summary</i>	64
Chapter Ten: Evidence of Effectiveness: Take-Up of Advice and Changes Made	65
<i>Introduction</i>	65
<i>Areas of Advice Giving at Baseline</i>	65
<i>Take-Up of Advice</i>	65
<i>Extent of Changes Made</i>	66
<i>'Other' Changes Made</i>	67
<i>Summary</i>	71
Chapter Eleven: Evidence of Effectiveness: Expectations and Satisfaction	72
<i>Introduction</i>	72
<i>A: Expectations</i>	72
<i>B: Satisfaction with Shiatsu Treatments</i>	72
<i>Summary</i>	73
Chapter Twelve: Uses and Change of Use of Other Health Care Providers: Economic Implications.....	74
<i>Introduction</i>	74
<i>Use of Other Health Care Providers for Any of These Problems</i>	74
<i>Summary</i>	76
SECTION THREE: SPAIN	77
Chapter Four: Study Participants and Study Representativeness	78
<i>Introduction</i>	78
<i>The Practitioners</i>	78
<i>The Clients</i>	79
<i>Baseline Recruitment and Response Rates over Time</i>	79
<i>Figure 4.1: Overview of response rates</i>	80
<i>Representativeness of Study Responders</i>	80
<i>Representativeness of Study Responders</i>	81
<i>Completion Levels in the Cohort</i>	82
<i>Summary</i>	82
Chapter Five: Who Uses Shiatsu, Why and For What Reasons?	83
<i>Introduction</i>	83

Socio-Demographic Characteristics at Baseline.....	83
Previous Use of Shiatsu and Other CAM at Baseline.....	83
Health Status at Baseline.....	83
Reasons for Having Shiatsu Treatment and Associated Symptoms	84
Symptoms as Reasons over the Six-Month Follow-up Period.....	85
Continuing Use of Shiatsu over the Six-Month Follow-Up Period.....	87
Summary.....	87
Chapter Six: The Clients' Hopes from Shiatsu	89
Introduction	89
Hopes from Their Shiatsu Treatment.....	89
Summary.....	94
Chapter Seven: The Client's Initial Experiences of Shiatsu	95
Introduction	95
Experiences during the Most Recent Shiatsu Treatment.....	95
Client-Practitioner Relationship.....	97
Experiences after the Most Recent Shiatsu Treatment	97
Summary.....	99
Summary.....	100
Chapter Eight: Evidence of Effectiveness: Symptom Change.....	101
Introduction	101
A: Improvements in Symptom Severity over the Six Months	101
B: Changes in Symptom Severity	102
C: Changes in Symptom Severity – Previous Users.....	103
D: Overall Effectiveness in Treating My Symptoms.....	104
Summary.....	104
Chapter Nine: Evidence of Effectiveness: Shiatsu-Specific Effects	105
Introduction	105
A: Overall Effects	105
B: Specific Symptom Changes	107
C: General Awareness Effects.....	108
D: General Attitudinal / Personal Effects.....	108
E: Relational Effects.....	109
Summary.....	110
Chapter Ten: Evidence of Effectiveness: Take-Up of Advice and Changes Made	111
Introduction	111
Areas of Advice Giving at Baseline.....	111
Take-Up of Advice	111
Extent of Changes Made	112
'Other' Changes Made	113
Summary.....	116
Chapter Eleven: Evidence of Effectiveness: Expectations and Satisfaction	117
Introduction	117
A: Expectations.....	117
B: Satisfaction with Shiatsu Treatments	117
Summary.....	118
Chapter Twelve: Uses and Change of Use of Other Health Care Providers: Economic Implications.....	119
Introduction	119
Use of Other Health Care Providers for Any of These Problems.....	119
Summary.....	121
SECTION FOUR: THE U.K.....	122
Chapter Four: Study Participants and Study Representativeness	123
Introduction	123
The Practitioners.....	123

<i>The Clients</i>	124
<i>Summary</i>	127
<i>Chapter Five: Who Uses Shiatsu, Why and For What Reasons?</i>	128
<i>Introduction</i>	128
<i>Socio-Demographic Characteristics at Baseline</i>	128
<i>Previous Use of Shiatsu and Other CAM at Baseline</i>	128
<i>Health Status at Baseline</i>	128
<i>Reasons for Having Shiatsu Treatment and Associated Symptoms</i>	129
<i>Reasons over the Six-Month Follow-up Period</i>	129
<i>Symptoms as Reasons for Accessing Shiatsu at Baseline</i>	130
<i>Symptoms as Reasons over the Six-Month Follow-up Period</i>	130
<i>Continuing Use of Shiatsu over the Six-Month Follow-Up Period</i>	132
<i>Summary</i>	132
<i>Chapter Six: The Client's Hopes from Shiatsu</i>	134
<i>Introduction</i>	134
<i>Hopes from Their Shiatsu Treatment</i>	134
<i>Summary</i>	142
<i>Chapter Seven: The Client's Initial Experiences of Shiatsu</i>	143
<i>Introduction</i>	143
<i>Experiences during the Most Recent Shiatsu Treatment</i>	143
<i>Client-Practitioner Relationship</i>	145
<i>Experiences after the Most Recent Shiatsu Treatment</i>	146
<i>Summary</i>	150
<i>Chapter Eight: Evidence of Effectiveness: Symptom Change</i>	151
<i>Introduction</i>	151
<i>A: Improvements in Symptom Severity over the Six Months</i>	151
<i>B: Changes in Symptom Severity</i>	152
<i>C: Changes in Symptom Severity – Previous Users</i>	153
<i>D: Overall Effectiveness in Treating My Symptoms</i>	154
<i>Summary</i>	155
<i>Chapter Nine: Evidence of Effectiveness: Shiatsu-Specific Effects</i>	156
<i>Introduction</i>	156
<i>A: Overall Effects</i>	156
<i>B: Specific Symptom Change</i>	159
<i>C: General Awareness Effects</i>	159
<i>D: General Attitudinal / Personal Effects</i>	160
<i>E: Relational Effects</i>	161
<i>Summary</i>	162
<i>Chapter Ten: Evidence of Effectiveness: Take-Up of Advice and Changes Made</i>	163
<i>Introduction</i>	163
<i>Areas of Advice Giving at Baseline</i>	163
<i>Take-Up of Advice</i>	163
<i>Extent of Changes Made</i>	164
<i>'Other' Changes Made</i>	165
<i>Summary</i>	169
<i>Chapter Eleven: Evidence of Effectiveness: Expectations and Satisfaction</i>	171
<i>Introduction</i>	171
<i>A: Expectations</i>	171
<i>B: Satisfaction with Shiatsu Treatments</i>	171
<i>Summary</i>	172
<i>Chapter Twelve: Uses and Change of Use of Other Health Care Providers: Economic Implications</i>	173
<i>Introduction</i>	173
<i>Use of Other Health Care Providers for Any of These Problems</i>	173
<i>Summary</i>	175

SECTION FIVE: COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS.....	176
Chapter Thirteen: Aspects of Safety, Negative Responses and Adverse Events to Shiatsu	177
<i>Introduction</i>	177
<i>Findings</i>	179
<i>Prevalence, Severity and Impact of Negative Responses.....</i>	180
<i>Form and Nature of Negative Responses.....</i>	182
<i>Types of Negative Responses.....</i>	186
<i>Type 1: Responses Unrelated to Shiatsu</i>	187
<i>Type 2: Transitional Effect (Client-Perceived and Theory-Consistent)</i>	188
<i>Type 3: Transitional Effect (Theory and Experientially Consistent)</i>	191
<i>Type 4: Undesired, But Not Unsafe</i>	193
<i>Type 5: Potentially Adverse Event and Risk to Client Safety.....</i>	196
<i>Summary.....</i>	198
<i>Chapter Fourteen: Comparative Analysis and Discussion</i>	199
<i>Introduction</i>	199
<i>Study Respondents.....</i>	199
<i>Shiatsu Users and Reasons for Use.....</i>	201
<i>Characteristics of a Typical Shiatsu User</i>	201
<i>Reasons for Use of Shiatsu</i>	203
<i>Client Hopes from Their Shiatsu Treatment.....</i>	205
<i>The Client-Practitioner Interaction</i>	206
<i>Immediate Effects from Shiatsu</i>	208
<i>Evidence on Safety and Negative Responses.....</i>	209
<i>Evidence of Effectiveness over the Longer Term</i>	210
<i>Symptom Change</i>	210
<i>Shiatsu-Specific Effects</i>	212
<i>Uptake of Advice.....</i>	213
<i>Expectations and Satisfaction.....</i>	215
<i>Summary of Effectiveness Evidence</i>	215
<i>Economic Implications</i>	216
<i>Summary.....</i>	217
SECTION SIX: IMPLICATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS	218
Chapter Fifteen: Conclusions and Key Messages for Policy and Practice	219
<i>Introduction</i>	219
<i>Strengths and Weaknesses of the Study.....</i>	219
<i>Conclusions and Key Messages.....</i>	222
<i>Areas for Further Research</i>	225
REFERENCES	227
APPENDICES	231
<i>Appendix 1</i>	232
<i>Appendix 2</i>	238
<i>Appendix 3</i>	242
<i>Appendix 4</i>	247

Index of Figures

Figures – Section 1

Figure 3.1: The Five Element Cycle adapted from Dan Reynolds	20
--------------------------------------------------------------------	----

Figures - Section 2 (Austria)

Figure 4.1: Overview of Response Rates.....	27
Figure 7.1a: Experiences – Previous Users	46
Figure 7.1b: Experiences – New Users	47
Figure 7.2a: Feelings – Previous Users	49
Figure 7.2b: Feelings – New Users	49
Figure 7.3: Possibly Negative Feelings	51
Figure 8.1a: Symptom Change – Previous Users	54
Figure 8.1b: Symptom Change – New Users	54

Figures – Section 3 (Spain)

Figure 4.1: Overview of Response Rates.....	80
Figure 7.1: Positive experiences during session	96
Figure 7.2: Feelings after session	98
Figure 7.3: Possibly negative feelings	99
Figure 8.1: Mean symptom change	102

Figures – Section 4 (UK)

Figure 4.1: Overview of Response Rates.....	125
Figure 7.1a: Experiences – Previous Users	144
Figure 7.1b: Experiences – New Users	145
Figure 7.2a: Feelings – Previous Users	148
Figure 7.2b: Feelings – New Users	148
Figure 7.3: Possibly Negative Feelings	149
Figure 8.1a: Symptom Change – Previous Users	152
Figure 8.1b: Symptom Change – New Users	152

Index of Tables

Tables - Section 2 (Austria)

Table 4.1: Socio-Demographic and Other Characteristics	28
Table 5.1: Reasons for <i>Shiatsu</i>	31
Table 5.2: Symptoms as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	32
Table 5.3: Symptoms, at 3-Month Follow-up, as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	33
Table 5.4: Symptoms, at 6-Month Follow-up, as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	33
Table 5.5: Continuing Use of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six-Month Follow-Up Period	34
Table 6.1: Top 15* Hopes from <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment.....	36
Table 6.2: Top 10**'Grouped' Hopes from <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	39
Table 7.1: 'Positive' Experiences During the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	46
Table 7.2: 'Negative' Experiences During the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment.....	47
Table 7.3: Client-Practitioner Relationship	48
Table 7.4: Perceptions of the <i>Shiatsu</i> Practitioner	48
Table 7.5: 'Positive' Feelings after the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	50
Table 7.6: Possibly 'Negative' Feelings after the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	51
Table 8.1: Mean Improvement in Symptoms over Time	53
Table 8.2: Adjusted Potential Effect over Time: Baseline to Three and Six Months	55
Table 8.3: Adjusted Potential Effect: First Time vs. Baseline	56
Table 8.4: Specific Symptom Change Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	57
Table 9.1: Baseline Health Status	59
Table 9.2: Health Status at Three and Six Months, compared to Baseline	59

Table 9.3: Overall Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	60
Table 9.4: Specific Symptom Change Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	61
Table 9.5: General Awareness Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	62
Table 9.6: General Attitudinal/Personal Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	63
Table 9.7: Relational Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months.....	64
Table 10.1: Changes Made as a Result of Having <i>Shiatsu</i>	66
Table 10.2: Extent of Change.....	67
Table 11.1: Meeting Client Expectations	72
Table 11.2: Levels of Satisfaction with <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatments	73
Table 12.1: Visits to a Family Physician/Hospital, Medication Use and Days off Work...75	75
Table 12.2: Use of Other Conventional Medicine, CAM and Medication	75

Tables – Section 3 (Spain)

Table 4.1: Socio-Demographic and Other Characteristics	81
Table 5.1: Reasons for <i>Shiatsu</i>	84
Table 5.2: Symptoms as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	85
Table 5.3: Symptoms, at 3-Month Follow-up, as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	86
Table 5.4: Symptoms, at 6-Month Follow-up, as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	86
Table 5.5: Continuing Use of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six-Month Follow-Up Period	87
Table 6.1: Top 15 Hopes from <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	90
Table 6.2: Top 10 'Grouped' Hopes from <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment.....	91
Table 7.1: Experiences <i>During</i> the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment.....	95
Table 7.2: 'Negative' Experiences <i>During</i> the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment.....	96
Table 7.3: Client-Practitioner Relationship	97
Table 7.4: Perceptions of the <i>Shiatsu</i> Practitioner	97
Table 7.5: 'Positive' Feelings <i>after</i> the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	98
Table 7.6: Possibly 'Negative' Feelings <i>after</i> the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	99
Table 8.1: Mean Improvement in Symptoms over Time.....	101
Table 8.2: Adjusted Potential Effect over Time: Baseline to Three and Six Months	103
Table 8.3: Adjusted Potential Effect: First Time vs. Baseline	104
Table 8.4: Specific Symptom Change Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	104
Table 9.1: Baseline Health Status	106
Table 9.2: Health Status at Three and Six Months, compared to Baseline	106
Table 9.3: Overall Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	107
Table 9.4: Specific Symptom Change Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	107
Table 9.5: General Awareness Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	108
Table 9.6: General Attitudinal/Personal Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	109
Table 9.7: Relational Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months.....	109
Table 10.1: Changes Made as a Result of Having <i>Shiatsu</i>	109
Table 10.2: Extent of Change.....	112
Table 11.1: Meeting Client Expectations	117
Table 11.2: Levels of Satisfaction with <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatments	118
Table 12.1: Visits to a Family Physician/Hospital, Medication Use and Days off Work.120	120
Table 12.2: Use of Other Conventional Medicine, CAM and Medication	121

Tables – Section 4 (UK)

Table 4.1: Socio-Demographic and Other Characteristics	126
Table 5.1: Reasons for <i>Shiatsu</i>	129
Table 5.2: Symptoms as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	130
Table 5.3: Symptoms, at 3-Month Follow-up, as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	131
Table 5.4: Symptoms, at 6-Month Follow-up, as Reasons for Accessing <i>Shiatsu</i>	131
Table 5.5: Continuing Use of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six-Month Follow-Up Period	132
Table 6.1: Top 15 Hopes from <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	135
Table 6.2: Top 10 'Grouped' Hopes from <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment.....	137
Table 7.1: 'Positive' Experiences <i>During</i> the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	144

Table 7.2: 'Negative' Experiences During the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment.....	145
Table 7.3: Client-Practitioner Relationship	146
Table 7.4: Perceptions of the <i>Shiatsu</i> Practitioner	146
Table 7.5: 'Positive' Feelings after the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment.....	147
Table 7.6: Possibly 'Negative' Feelings after the Most Recent <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	149
Table 8.1: Mean Improvement in Symptoms over Time	151
Table 8.2: Adjusted Potential Effect over Time: Baseline to Three and Six Months	153
Table 8.3: Adjusted Potential Effect: First Time vs. Baseline	154
Table 8.4: Specific Symptom Change Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	154
Table 9.1: Baseline Health Status	157
Table 9.2: Health Status at Three and Six Months, compared to Baseline	157
Table 9.3: Overall Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	158
Table 9.4: Specific Symptom Change Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	159
Table 9.5: General Awareness Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	160
Table 9.6: General Attitudinal/Personal Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	161
Table 9.7: Relational Effects of <i>Shiatsu</i> over the Six Months	162
Table 10.1: Changes Made as a Result of Having <i>Shiatsu</i>	164
Table 10.2: Extent of Change.....	164
Table 11.1: Meeting Client Expectations	171
Table 11.2: Levels of Satisfaction with <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatments	172
Table 12.1: Visits to a Family Physician/Hospital, Medication Use and Days off Work.	174
Table 12.2: Use of Other Conventional Medicine, CAM and Medication	174

Tables - Section 5

Table 13.1: Negative Responses over Time (Austria).....	181
Table 13.2: Negative Responses over Time (Spain).....	181
Table 13.3 Negative Responses over Time (UK)	182
Table 13.4: Negative Responses (Austria).....	184
Table 13.5: Negative Responses (Spain).....	184
Table 13.6: Negative Responses (UK)	185
Table 13.7: Negative Responses (All Countries and Time Points).....	185
Table 13.8: Response Types across Data Collection Points by Country	186
Table 14.1: Overview of Response Rates and Representativeness	200
Table 14.2: Profile of a Typical <i>Shiatsu</i> User	201
Table 14.3: Reasons for Access and Reasons as Symptoms.....	204
Table 14.4: Top Client Hopes of their <i>Shiatsu</i> Treatment	206
Table 14.5: The Client-Practitioner Relationship and Perception of the Treatment Environment	207
Table 14.6: Immediate 'Positive' Effects.....	208
Table 14.7: Immediate 'Possibly Negative' Effects.....	209
Table 14.8: Overview of Findings on Symptom Change	211
Table 14.9: Overview of Findings on <i>Shiatsu</i> -Specific Effects at Six Months	212
Table 14.9: Advice and Uptake of Advice.....	214